



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

DRAFT MINUTES

Monday, November 15, 2010 **David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street** **3:00 P.M.**

BOARD MEMBERS:

CHRISTOPHER MANSON-HING, Chair
DAWN SHERRY, Vice-Chair
CLAY AURELL
CHRISTOPHER GILLILAND
GARY MOSEL
KEITH RIVERA
PAUL ZINK

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO GRANT HOUSE (ALTERNATE)

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

BRUCE BARTLETT STELLA LARSON (ALTERNATE)

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor
TONY BOUGHMAN, Planning Technician
GLORIA SHAFER, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST (See ABR Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	<u>Master Application & Submittal Fee</u> - (Location: 630 Garden Street) <u>Photographs</u> - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board. <u>Plans</u> - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised. <u>Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations</u> - (Include on first drawing) <u>Site Plan</u> - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures. <u>Exterior elevations</u> - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	<u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Rough sketches</u> are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Plans</u> - floor, roof, etc. <u>Site Sections</u> - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable. <u>Preliminary Landscape Plans</u> - required for commercial & multi-family; single-family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	<u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions: <u>Color & Material Samples</u> - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans. <u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable. <u>Exterior Details</u> - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc. <u>Final Landscape Plans</u> - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan. <u>Consultant/Engineer Plans</u> - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following Architectural Board of Review (ABR) agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, a rescheduling fee will be paid and the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) in addition to submitting appropriate plans.
- All approvals made by the ABR are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.68 and with adopted ABR guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- The ABR may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- The Board may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final ABR approval.
- Concept review comments are valid for one year. A Preliminary approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension has been granted. A Final approval is valid for two years from the date of final action unless a time extension has been granted or a Building Permit has been issued.
- Decisions of the ABR may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Appeals must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall, 735 Anacapa St. within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Board took action or rendered its decision.
- **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT:** In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to gain access to, comment at, or participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at 805-564-5470. If possible, notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements in most cases.
- **AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS:** Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr. **Materials related to an item on this agenda submitted to the ABR after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Community Development Department located at 630 Garden St., during normal business hours.** If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Tony Boughman, at (805) 564-5470 extension 4539, or by email at tboughman@santabarbaraca.gov. Office hours are 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Thursday, and every other Friday. Please check our website under City Calendar to verify closure dates.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. On Wednesday, November 10, 2010, the Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/abr.
- B. This regular meeting of the Architectural Board of Review will be broadcast live on City TV-18, or on your computer via <http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video/> and then clicking City TV-18 Live Broadcast. City TV-18 will also rebroadcast this meeting in its entirety on Wednesday at Noon and the following Monday at 9:00 a.m. An archived video copy of this meeting will be viewable on computers with high speed internet access the following Wednesday at www.santabarbaraca.gov/abr and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

CALL TO ORDER.

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. by Vice-Chair Sherry.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Aurell, Gilliland, Mosel, Rivera, Sherry, Zink (in at 3:10)

Members absent: Manson-Hing

Staff present: Boughman, Limon, Shafer

GENERAL BUSINESS:

- A. Public Comment:
- No public comment.
- B. Approval of Minutes:
- Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Architectural Board of Review meeting of November 1, 2010, as submitted.
- Action: Mosel/Rivera, 3/0/2. Motion carried. (Rivera, Sherry abstained. Manson-Hing, Zink absent.)
- C. Consent Calendar:
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of November 8, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gary Mosel with landscaping reviewed by Christopher Gilliland.
- Action: Aurell/Rivera, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing, Zink absent.)
- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of November 15, 2010. The Consent Calendar was reviewed by Gary Mosel with landscaping reviewed by Christopher Gilliland.
- Action: Riviera/Gilliland, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing, Zink absent.)
- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
- Mr. Boughman announced that Chair Manson-Hing will be absent, and Mr. Zink will step down from Item 1, 1015 San Andres Street.
- E. Subcommittee Reports – No reports.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW**1. 1015 SAN ANDRES ST****R-2 Zone****(3:10)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-242-011
Application Number: MST2006-00438
Designer: Amaro Design
Owner: The Rodriguez/Espinosa Family Trust
Agent: Ben Woodall

(Proposal to demolish the existing 1,581 square foot single family residence and detached two-car garage; and construction of a new 4,510 square foot two-story duplex on an 8,000 square foot lot in the R-2 Zone. Unit one is a proposed two-story, three-bedroom, 2,107 square feet. Unit two is a proposed two-story, three-bedroom 2,403 square feet, including a two-car garage for each unit.)

(Previous Preliminary Approval expired. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 3:09

Present: Ben Woodall, Agent.

Public comment was opened at 3:20 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to Consent Calendar with the following comments:

- 1) Show trash enclosure for both units on the site plan; adjust the landscape plan as necessary.
- 2) Increase the radius of the planting bulb out along the southeast side of the driveway.
- 3) A wood clad window system is preferred as detailed on the plans, rather than the Milgard aluminum.
- 4) Verify Storm Water Management Program compliance.
- 5) Provide the size of the proposed wrought iron at the front entry gate.

Action: Aurell/Rivera, 5/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink stepped down. Manson-Hing absent.)

REVIEW AFTER FINAL**2. 535 E MONTECITO ST****M-1 Zone****(3:40)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-351-010
Application Number: MST2006-00530
Owner: City Ventures
Applicants: Bill McReynolds
Architect: William Hezmalhalch Architects Inc.
Landscape Architect: Katie O'Reilly Rogers

(The proposal is a redesign of a project previously approved by the Planning Commission. The proposed project consists of 48 residential condominium units in 4 two- and three-story buildings, on a 1.8-acre vacant lot. The size of the residential units would vary, ranging between 994 and 2,086 square feet. Each of the four buildings would contain twelve residential units and would have individual courtyards. All units would have a two-car garage, with a mix of side by side configuration and tandem configuration. Four guest parking spaces would be provided, resulting in a total of 100 on-site parking spaces. Vehicle access would be provided from both East Montecito Street and Calle Cesar Chavez. Forty of the 48 units would be sold as below-market rate units. A 14-foot wide shared access easement is provided along the western perimeter of the project site. The prior approvals consisted of a Tentative Subdivision Map, a Modification to provide less than the required amount of guest parking and City Council approval of a Specific Plan (SP-10). The redesigned project received a Substantial Conformance Determination at the Planning Commission on November 19, 2009.)

(Review after Final referred from Consent Calendar for addition of solar panels and change of roof material.)

Actual time: 3:35

Present: Bill McReynolds, Applicant; Tim Lose, Construction Manager; Addison Marks, SunPower Solar.

Public comment was opened at 3:46 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Continued two weeks to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Return with details of the all typical panel mounting conditions.
- 2) Follow the pitch of the roof with panels.
- 3) Provide consistency throughout the project regarding placement of solar panels relative to adjacent roof elements.
- 4) Balance and simplify the solar panel layout wherever possible to eliminate jogs in arrays.
- 5) Show locations of roofing material changes for roof access, i.e. concrete s-tile.
- 6) Push solar panels back from roof edges, particularly in locations which abut the public way.

Action: Rivera/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED ITEM**3. 826 DE LA VINA ST****C-2 Zone**

(4:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-042-001
Application Number: MST2010-00289
Owner: Gold Lab, LLC
Architect: Henry Lenny

(Proposal to remodel the south and west elevations, consisting of thickening exterior walls, recessing windows, and stuccoing the exterior.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:13

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect.

Public comment was opened at 4:17 p.m.

A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

As no one wished to speak, public comment was closed.

Motion: Preliminary Approval and continued to the Full Board for in-progress review with the following comments:

- 1) The architecture is acceptable.
- 2) Consider changing the material of the wall to match the north building.
- 3) Provide information about the back elevation of building.
- 4) Indicate where window bars are proposed to be removed.
- 5) Provide details for the awning.

Action: Gilliland/Aurell, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Manson-Hing absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**4. 513 GARDEN ST****C-M Zone**

(4:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-202-009
Application Number: MST2010-00168
Architect: Barry Winick
Owner: Macy Cornerstone LLC
Architect: Mark Macy

(Proposal for a two-story mixed-used project consisting of 2,730 square feet of new commercial space and 3,600 square feet of new residential space in nine residential studio units. The existing 1,144 square foot commercial building will remain on the 14,500 square foot lot.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Actual time: 4:26

Present: Barry Winick, Architect representing Mark Macy, Architect; Allen Macy, Owner; David Black, Landscape Architect.

Ms. Sherry and Mr. Rivera disclosed that they were individually contacted by the applicant to review the project and provide feedback.

Public comment was opened at 4:47 p.m.

Laura Inks, Director of Education, The Granada: in support.

Ginny Brush, Executive Director of Santa Barbara Arts Commission: in support.

Ten letters in support and one letter in opposition were acknowledged.

Public comment was closed at 4:51 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The overall site planning is acceptable.
- 2) Study the relationship of the common open space area, the trash/recycling area, and the bicycle parking to improve visibility of open space.
- 3) Study adding articulation to the south elevation; either with building mass articulation and/or with material color to break up the wall at the southern property line.
- 4) Study a more articulated pedestrian entry incorporating ADA ramp access.
- 5) Study the street elevation of unit 113 and its relationship with the adjacent street facades.
- 6) The Board is mixed on the use of bridge element connecting the two buildings.
- 7) Provide a landscape plan. Include as much planting as possible and canopy trees; study the use of planting material at the property line fences.
- 8) Develop articulation of the fence height and material with the adjacent building masses.
- 9) Study the fenestration and orientation of the units, particularly between units 205, 207, and 208.

Action: Rivera/Aurell, 5/1/0. Motion carried. (Zink opposed to two-story mass next to adjacent one-story to north. Manson-Hing absent.)

ADJOURNMENT

The Full Board meeting was adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (1:00)

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM

A. 330 W CANON PERDIDO ST

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-302-024

Application Number: MST2010-00278

Owner: Stephen V. and Celeste E. Harrel Living Trust

(Proposal to demolish an existing one-story single-family residence and construct a new two-story duplex consisting of a 1,080 square foot unit, a 1,197 square foot unit, an attached 429 square foot two-car garage, an attached 495 square foot two car garage with a new driveway from Castillo Street, and fences, walkways, and landscaping. The proposed total development of 3,201 square feet is located on a 5,000 square foot lot.)

(Comments only; project requires environmental assessment.)

Continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with comments: 1) Provide more variety of riparian plants within the front drainage swale. 3) Reduce the depth of the driveway swale to a maximum 3% slope. 4) If bioswale excavation around the roots of two avocado trees results in their loss the trees must be replaced. 5) Note on plans a double starter course of two-piece tile. 6) Provide color board showing canvas awning and garage door colors. 7) Provide window and door specifications.

ABR - NEW ITEM

B. 1623 CHINO ST

R-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-212-005
Application Number: MST2010-00344
Owner: Florentina Castro
Designer: Mark Morando

(Proposal to abate violations outlined in ENF2010-00499 by removing the unpermitted addition to Unit A, legalize the front bay window to Unit A, remove the unpermitted rear addition to Unit B, permit interior remodel to Unit B, remove the front 6 foot high front wooden fence and install a new 6 foot high rolling gate and provide two uncovered parking spaces. The property is currently developed with two detached dwelling units.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Continued one week to Consent Calendar with comments: 1) Provide a color board. 2) Provide a planting plan showing foundation planting. 3) Add a roof over the bay widow. 4) Separate the driveway paving from yard paving. 5) The as-built window changes are acceptable. 6) Enhance Unit B's entry facing the street.

ABR - NEW ITEM

C. 212 W ARRELLAGA ST

R-4 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-171-015
Application Number: MST2010-00326
Owner: NSM Miramesa LLC
Architect: Bildsten and Sherwin Design Studio

(Proposal to construct a 226 square foot second story addition and convert the attic storage space to habitable space for an existing two-story single-family residence. There is an existing two-story duplex to remain unaltered at the rear of the 7,809 square foot lot.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Final Approval with conditions: 1) Add shrubs in front of the house. 2) Study the proposed shades of green colors and use a darker color for the foundation skirt.

ABR - FINAL REVIEW**D. 130 N CALLE CESAR CHAVEZ****M-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-030-005
Application Number: MST2010-00067
Owner: Kenneth James LLC
Agent: Roy Harthorn
Architect: Joseph Moticha

(Proposal to permit the as-built construction of 2,909 square feet of commercial buildings on an existing 1.88 acre lot which is currently developed with 21,355 square feet of commercial buildings. The as-built construction is composed of an addition of 250 square feet to building 1, a 575 square foot addition to building 17, a 720 square foot addition to building 18, a 520 square foot addition to building 19, a 133 square foot addition to building 20, a 1,186 square foot addition to building 28, and a 560 square foot canopy addition to building 15. The proposal includes permitting an as-built trellis and deck for the existing building 22, new accessible parking spaces, paths of travel, alterations to the site landscaping, and restriping the existing parking area. A total of 52 parking spaces are proposed on-site, which includes 12 parking spaces per an existing parking easement for the property at 208 N. Calle Cesar Chavez. The as-built additions require Development Plan Approval by the ABR for 2,909 square feet of non-residential square footage. The 2,909 square feet figure excludes the 560 square foot canopy and 475 square feet for a building demolished under a separate permit.)

Final Approval as submitted.

ABR - NEW ITEM**E. 401 OLD COAST HWY****C-P/R-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-291-011
Application Number: MST2010-00267
Owner: David Joel Munoz
Applicant: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting
Architect: Paul Zink

(Proposal for a Conditional Use Permit to allow an existing automobile repair business to operate in the C-P/R-2 zone and to permit the as-built alterations consisting of three auto lifts, 561 square foot interior mezzanine, roll-up door, to provide ADA accessibility, improve fire-rated construction, and modify site landscaping. The proposal addresses violations in ENF2009-01437. The project requires Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit.)

(Comments only; project requires Planning Commission review of a Conditional Use Permit.)

Public comment:

Tony Fischer, Attorney for William Pritchett, opposed: concerns about this use in this zone; this use needs environmental assessment; lot size on plans may not be correct; conflict of parking in front of doors; traffic safety of intersection in front of project.

Sylvio Guadagnini, in support: traffic safety is not an issue; the owner has been a good neighbor; lighting will enhance safety.

Suzanne Riegle, Assistant Planner commented that the parking configuration has been reviewed and found acceptable, and that Wick's Boiler Service's use in this zone has been reviewed and found acceptable.

Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments: 1) Door and architectural changes are acceptable; verify widths of doors. 2) Coordinate the light fixtures with the photometric study. 3) Increase the size of planter at the left front of building and install an appropriate narrow tree with understory landscaping. 4) Add a shrub and vine at middle front planter under existing tree; suggest deciduous trees at the west front near the neighbor's building. 5) The increase of landscaping to 10% of lot area is a positive change. 6) The removal of the landscape finger in rear parking lot is acceptable and there is an appropriate amount of landscaping proposed. 7) No change in the mass is proposed.

ABR - CONTINUED ITEM

F. 936 SAN PASCUAL ST BLD D

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-292-019

Application Number: MST2010-00319

Owner: Pini Dario

Agent: Catherine Dunbar

(Proposal to permit as-built window changes and paint color changes, and review of landscaping for an existing apartment complex. The proposal will address the violations outlined in ENF2010-00384.)

Postponed one week at the applicant's request.

Items on Consent Calendar were reviewed by Gary Mosel with landscaping reviewed by Chris Gilliland.
Staff Present: Tony Boughman.